

HRC Consideration and Recommendation

Permit Request 19-0183

for Demolition of Accessory Garage Structure at 1203 Olympia Avenue

Facts and Findings

Background information

- The garage structure is shown on Sanborn Maps of this property dating back to 1908.
- The property has been owned by current owner (Homes First) since 1995.
- The property was assessed for historic value and included in Olympia Avenue Historic District when that district was created in 2004.
- The garage is not included in the property description included in the approved Olympia Avenue Historic District.
- City records show that the current owner received all notices and communications relative to the local historic district listing including the “Standards for Review of Changes within the District.”
- The known history of alterations to the primary structure includes the following:

1997: Exterior stairway installed
Window replacement – complete
Siding replacement - estimated at 25% replacement
Exterior paint following testing at both house and garage
Chimney demolition & re-construction
Extensive interior work

2007: Exterior Paint stabilization on both house and garage

2017: Remainder of siding replaced in drop-siding style with new materials; fishscale shingles at gable ends retained.
Exterior paint on house only; garage intended for demolition.

2018: Commercial Re-roof (permit 18-2286), funded by Boeing Foundation Grant
Tree removal (permit 18-2589)
Civil Engineering for sidewalk remove/replace (permit 18-5240)

2019: Partial window RE-replacement, funded by Boeing Foundation Grant
Proposed garage demolition

Lead-Based Paint Analysis

- 2007 lead-Based paint analysis discovered L-B paint hazards at the north and east sides of the garage structure. The south and west sides of the garage building tested negative.
- The sides that tested negative are showing the most extensive peeling of paint.

Historic Preservation Review

May, 1996 – DAHP, property ineligible for National Register

Site Visit

Visual inspection of the garage structure showed the following:

- Original siding of the garage is intact. (Ron Steward later indicated that some siding had been replaced, using profile of original materials).
- Original form and massing is intact.
- Sliding door configuration is believed to be original, though door itself is probably not.
- A mixture of original and non-original structural members and rafters are present on the interior. Garage is filled with stored items, making interior structure difficult to view.
- Building is “poorly framed” according to owner.
- Roof appears to be non-original, in fair to poor condition.
- Concrete foundation shows board-form patterns. Foundation has one visible crack.
- Exterior paint is badly peeling and flaking. The cause of the paint deterioration is unknown.
- Structure is used for storage of unused furnishings and garbage.

Historic District Listing information

- The district includes this property as “Contributing Primary,” defined as follows:
“Contributing primary buildings are those structures which would not be individually eligible for the Heritage Register but could be restored to qualify for the Heritage Register and/or contribute significantly to the criteria which make the district significant”
- Narrative description of the district “Condition and Integrity” (as presented to City Council 1/24/2005) noted the following:
“Aside from some maintenance issues, the buildings are generally in good conditions. The major issues relating to integrity are the numerous window changes in the houses from wood to primarily vinyl sash.....staff has included the properties which have had window changes as contributing properties to the district primarily because they retain their overall form and much of their detailing. These building contribute to the streetscape as representatives from important architectural periods.”
- The district listing description for 1203 Olympia Ave notes that “the house has a variety of replacement vinyl one over one, sliding and multi-pane windows”

De-Listing of Property

18.12.110 Removal of Designation

In the event that any property is no longer deemed appropriate for designation to the Heritage Register, the Heritage Commission may remove such designation by the same procedure as provided for in establishing the

designation, particularly Section [18.12.085\(D\)](#), (E) and (F). A property may be removed from the Olympia Heritage Register without the owner's consent.

- There is no known precedent for de-listing in Olympia.
- It does not appear to have further degraded in level of integrity from the original nomination date.
- Staff recommends against it given 2005 notes quoted above.

(DRAFT) Conclusions:

The primary residence continues to be an important contributor to the historic district.

- Much of the work on the primary structure that resulted in a loss of integrity occurred before the property was included in the local Olympia Avenue Historic District.
- Loss of character due to alterations to the primary structure were acknowledged by Heritage Commission when it was designated "primary contributing" in 2005.

The garage structure retains some historic integrity in spite of alterations and insufficient maintenance, but is in need of extensive repairs.

- While lead-based paint was found on two sides, paint on all sides is peeling heavily and all sides are assumed to be contaminated.
- Structural integrity is unknown but appears poor
- Roof is in need of repair/re-roof
- Foundation is cracked
- Interior structural members and framing are of questionable quality.

Potential Recommendations

Allow demolition

- The accessory structure is not a significant contributor to the historic character of the property or the neighborhood, despite its individual integrity and compatibility with the primary structure.
- Costs to fully abate LBP and render the garage structurally sound and water-tight do not align with owner's program or financial priorities.
- Lead paint is a present safety risk for tenants, who include single mothers and children.

Or

Recommend against demolition, pending additional information on remediation needs and costs.

- While not specifically addressed in the property listing for the historic district, the garage has been a documented part of the historic property for 114 years and is largely unchanged. It retains original form and materials, and *barring major structural flaws*, appears to be only in need of maintenance, which should be completed on schedule with the main residence.
- The concern over LBP is not itself sufficient cause for demolition.